24

RONALD L. OLSON (SBN 44597)	STUART A. C. DRAKE (Pro hac vice)
	sdrake@kirkland.com ANDREW B. CLUBOK (Pro hac vice)
Daniel.Collins@mto.com	aclubok@kirkland.com
355 South Grand Avenue, 35th Floor	SUSAN E. ENGEL (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) seengel@kirkland.com
Los Angeles, CA 90071-1560	KIRKLÄND & ELLIS LLP
Facsimile: (213) 687-3702	655 Fifteenth Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005
JEROME C. ROTH (SBN 159483)	Telephone: (202) 879-5173 Facsimile: (202) 879-5200
Jerome.Roth@mto.com	ELIZABETH DEELEY (SBN 230798)
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 560 Mission Street	edeeley@kirkland.com
San Francisco, CA 94105-2907	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP 555 California Street
Facsimile: (415) 512-4000	San Francisco, CA 94104
Attorneys for Defendant	Telephone: (415) 439-1861 Facsimile: (415) 439-1500
SHELL OIL COMPANY	Attorneys for CONOCOPHILLIPS
	COMPANY
TRACIE J. RENFROE (Pro hac vice)	MATTHEW HEARTNEY (SBN 123516)
JONATHAN L. MARSH (Pro hac vice)	Matthew.Heartney@aporter.com ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
jmarsh@kslaw.com ROBERT MEADOWS (Pro hac vice)	777 S. Figueroa Street, 44th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90017-5844
rmeadows@kslaw.com	Telephone: (213) 243-4150
	Facsimile: (213) 243-4199
Houston, TX 77002-5213	PHILIP H. CURTIS (Pro hac vice)
11 was 7 to 12 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	Philip.Curtis@aporter.com (Pro hac vice)
LISA KOBIALKA (SBN 191404)	MICHAEL B. GERRARD (pro hac vice) Michael.Gerrard@ aporter.com
	(pro hac vice)
1000 Bridge parkway, Suite 100	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP 399 Park Avenue
	New York, New York 10022 Telephone: (212) 715-1000
Facsimile: (650) 590-1900	Facsimile: (212) 715-1000
Attorneys for Defendants	Attorneys for BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP
CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.	PRODUCTS NORTH AMERICA, INC.
II	İ
	Ronald.Olson@mto.com DANIEL P. COLLINS (SBN 139164) Daniel.Collins@mto.com MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 355 South Grand Avenue, 35th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071-1560 Telephone: (213) 683-9100 Facsimile: (213) 687-3702 JEROME C. ROTH (SBN 159483) Jerome.Roth@mto.com MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 560 Mission Street San Francisco, CA 94105-2907 Telephone: (415) 512-4000 Facsimile: (415) 512-4077 Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY TRACIE J. RENFROE (Pro hac vice) trenfroe@kslaw.com JONATHAN L. MARSH (Pro hac vice) trenfroe@kslaw.com ROBERT MEADOWS (Pro hac vice) rmeadows@kslaw.com KING & SPALDING LLP 1100 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000 Houston, TX 77002-5213 Telephone: (713) 751-3200 Facsimile: (713) 751-3290 LISA KOBIALKA (SBN 191404) lkobialka@kslaw.com KING & SPALDING LLP 1000 Bridge parkway, Suite 100 Redwood City, CA 94065 Telephone: (650) 590-0700 Facsimile: (650) 590-1900 Attorneys for Defendants CHEVRON CORPORATION and

	Qase 4:08-cv-01138-SBA Docu	ment 124	Filed 05/28/2008	Page 4 of 21
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	JOHN F. DAUM (SBN 52313) jdaum@omm.com JONATHAN D. HACKER (Pro h jhacker@omm.com O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP 400 South Hope Street Los Angeles, CA 90071-2899 Telephone: (213) 430-6111 Facsimile: (213) 430-6407 Attorneys for Defendant EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	,	welshr@gtlaw.c SCOTT BERTZ bertzyks@gtlaw FELIX LEBRO lebronf@gtlaw.c KAMRAN SAL salourk@gtlaw.c GREENBERG 2450 Colorado A Santa Monica, C Telephone: (310 Facsimile: (310	CYK (SBN 116449) 7.com N (SBN 232984) com OUR (SBN 247983) com FRAURIG LLP Avenue, Suite 400E CA 90404 0) 586-7700 0) 586-7800 efendant The AES
10				
11				
12	SAMUEL R. MILLER (SBN 6687	71)	F. WILLIAM B	ROWNELL (Pro hac vice)
13	srmiller@sidley.com SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP		bbrownell@hun	ton.com FICHTHORN (<i>Pro hac vice</i>)
14	555 California Street San Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: (415) 772-1200		nfichthorn@hun ALLISON D. W	ton.com OOD (<i>Pro hac vice</i>)
15	Facsimile: (415) 772-7400		awood@hunton. HUNTON & WI	ILLIAMS LLP
16	DAVID T. BUENTE, JR. (Pro hac	c vice)	1900 K Street, N Washington, D.C Telephone: (202	C. 20006-1109
17	dbuente@sidley.com JOSEPH R. GUERRA (Pro hac vid	ce)	Facsimile: (202	2) 778-2201
18	jguerra@sidley.com SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP 1501 K Street, N.W.		SHAWN PATRI sregan@hunton.o HUNTON & WI	
19 20	Washington, D.C. 20005 Telephone: (202) 736-8000		200 Park Avenue New York, NY 1	2
21	Facsimile: (202) 736-8711		Telephone: (212 Facsimile: (212	2) 309-1000
22	Attorneys for Defendants AMERIC ELECTRIC POWER COMPANY,	AMERICAN	Attorneys for De	efendants DTE ENERGY
23	ELECTRIC POWER SERVICE CO DUKE ENERGY CORP.	ORP., AND	MIDAMERICAI	DISON INTERNATIONAL, N ENERGY HOLDINGS
24			CORP., AND TH	NACLE WEST CAPITAL HE SOUTHERN COMPANY
25				
26				
27				
28				

1	JEFFREY A. LAMKEN (SBN 154217) jeffrey.lamken@bakerbotts.com	THOMAS A. RECTOR (SBN 199173) tarector@jonesday.com
2	JEREMY LEVIN (SBN 210577) jeremy.levin@bakerbotts.com	JONES DAY 555 California Street, 26th Floor
3	BAKÉR BOTTS LLP The Warner	San Francisco, CA 94104
4	1299 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.	Telephone: 415-626-3939 Facsimile: 415-875-5700
5	Washington D.C. 20004-2400 Telephone: (202) 639-7700	THOMAS E PENDENT OF A
6	Facsimile: (202) 639-7890	THOMAS E. FENNELL (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) tefennell@jonesday.com
7	Attorneys for Defendants DYNEGY HOLDINGS INC., NRG ENERGY, INC., AND RELIANT ENERGY, INC.	MICHAEL L. RICE (<i>Pro hac vice</i>)) mlrice@jonesday.com JONES DAY
8	LIVERGI, IIVC.	2727 N. Harwood Street Dallas, TX 75201
9		Telephone: 214-220-3939 Facsimile: 214-969-5100
10		KEVIN P. HOLEWINSKI (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) kpholewinski@jonesday.com
11		JONES DAY 41 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.
12		Washington, D.C. 20001 Telephone: 202-879-3939
13		Facsimile: 202-626-1700
14		Attorneys for Defendant XCEL ENERGY INC.
15		
16	KATHLEEN TAYLOR SOOY (Pro hac vice) ksooy@crowell.com	ROBERT B. PRINGLE (SBN 051365) rbpringle@thelen.com
17	SCOTT L. WINKELMAN (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) swinkelman@crowell.com	LAURA A. GUILLEN (SBN 248874) laguillen@thelen.com
18	TRACY A. ROMAN (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) troman@crowell.com	THELEN REID BROWN RAYSMAN & STEINER LLP
19	CROWELL & MORING LLP 1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.	101 Second Street, Suite 1800 San Francisco, CA 94105
20	Washington, D.C. 20004-2595 Telephone: 202-624-2500	Telephone: (415) 371-1200 Facsimile: (415) 371-1211
21	Facsimile: 202-628-5116	KEVIN A. GAYNOR (<i>Pro hac vice</i>)
22	STEVEN P. RICE (SBN 94321) srice@crowell.com	kgaynor@velaw.com BENJAMIN S. LIPPARD
23	CROWELL & MORING LLP 3 Park Plaza	blippard@velaw.com VINSON & ELKINS LLP
24	Irvine, CA 92614 Telephone: 949-798-1310	1455 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
	Facsimile: 949-263-8414	Washington, D.C. 20004-1008 Telephone: (202) 639-6500
25	Attorneys for Defendant PEABODY ENERGY CORPORATION	Facsimile: (202) 639-6604
26	COID ORATION	Attorneys for Defendant MIRANT CORP.
27		
- a - 1		

WHEREAS, on May 16, 2008, the Court entered an Order Re: Case Management Conference directing the Parties¹ to meet and confer telephonically concerning the "schedule and format of any motions under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)," and to submit to the Court, by May 28, 2008, their proposals for the same, either in the form of a stipulation or administrative motion;

WHEREAS, the Parties agree that it is in the interest of the Parties and the Court to devise a schedule and format that consolidates the number and size of the Rule 12(b)-related briefs to the extent possible, without limiting the rights of any party;

WHEREAS, the Parties have met and conferred telephonically regarding the appropriate schedule and format for the briefing of Rule 12(b) motions in this action;

NOW THEREFORE, the Parties, through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate as follows:

Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1)/12(b)(6) Briefs

<u>Utility Defendants²</u>

1. The Utility Defendants will file a single consolidated brief under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6), not to exceed 50 pages, addressing counts 1, 2 and 4 of Plaintiffs' Complaint. Plaintiffs will file a single consolidated opposition brief, not to exceed 50 pages. The Utility Defendants will file a single consolidated reply brief, not to exceed 30 pages (*i.e.*, no more than 60 percent of the pages allotted for the moving and opposition briefs, as contemplated by Local Rule 7-4(b)).

For the purposes of this Stipulation, the term "Parties" refers to Plaintiffs and the following Defendants (which are hereafter referred to, collectively, as "Defendants"): ExxonMobil Corporation, BP America, Inc., BP North America, Inc., Chevron Corporation, Chevron U.S.A., Inc., ConocoPhillips Company, Shell Oil Company, The AES Corporation, American Electric Power Company, Inc., American Electric Power Service Corporation, DTE Energy Company, Duke Energy Corporation, Dynegy Holdings Inc., Edison International, MidAmerican Energy Holdings Company, Mirant Corporation, NRG Energy, Inc., Pinnacle West Capital Corporation, Reliant Energy, Inc., Southern Company, Xcel Energy Inc., and Peabody Energy Corporation.

For the purposes of this Stipulation, the term "Utility Defendants" refers to the following Defendants: The AES Corporation, American Electric Power Company, Inc., American Electric Power Service Corporation, DTE Energy Company, Duke Energy Corporation, Dynegy Holdings Inc., Edison International, MidAmerican Energy Holdings Company, Mirant Corporation, NRG Energy, Inc., Pinnacle West Capital Corporation, Reliant Energy, Inc., Southern Company, and Xcel Energy Inc.

25

26

27

28

American Electric Power Company, Inc., Duke Energy Corporation, and Southern 2. Company (the Utility Defendants named in count 3 of the Complaint) will file a single consolidated brief, not to exceed 25 pages, addressing count 3 of the Complaint. Plaintiffs will file a single opposition brief, not to exceed 25 pages. AEP, Duke and Southern will file a reply brief not to exceed 15 pages.

Oil Company Defendants³

3. The Oil Company Defendants will file a single consolidated brief under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1) addressing counts 1 through 4 of the Complaint. The Oil Company Defendants also will file a single consolidated brief under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) addressing counts 1 through 4 of the Complaint. The total number of combined pages for these two briefs shall not exceed 75 pages. Plaintiffs' opposition brief to each such motion shall not exceed the length of the motion to which it responds. The Oil Company Defendants will file a single consolidated reply brief in support of each such motion, and each such reply shall not exceed 60% of the page length of the motion that it supports.

Peabody Energy Corp.

Peabody will file a single brief under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6), not to 4. exceed 50 pages. Plaintiffs will file an opposition brief not to exceed 50 pages. Peabody will file a reply brief not to exceed 30 pages.

- In the alternative to the briefing format outlined in paragraphs 1 through 4 above, 5. Plaintiffs retain the option to consolidate some or all of their briefs into one or more briefs, the total length of which shall not exceed the combined page total allocated for the Defendants' opening briefs.
- The opening briefs discussed in paragraphs 1 through 5 above will be filed and 6. served electronically on Plaintiffs on or before June 30, 2008. Plaintiffs' opposition briefs will be

For the purposes of this Stipulation, the term "Oil Company Defendants" refers to the following Defendants: ExxonMobil Corporation, BP America, Inc., BP North America, Inc., Chevron Corporation, Chevron U.S.A., Inc., ConocoPhillips Company, and Shell Oil Company.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

1	LAW OFFICES OF MATTHEW F. PAWA, P.C.	HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP
2	1111/1/1	
3	By:	By:Belynda B, Reck
4	Matthew F. Pawa	Belynda B. Reck
5	Attorneys for Plaintiffs NATIVE VILLAGE OF KIVALINA and	Attorneys for Defendants DTE ENERGY COMPANY, EDISON
6	CITY OF KIVALINA	INTERNATIONAL, MIDAMERICAN ENERGY HOLDINGS COMPANY
7		PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORP., AND THE SOUTHERN COMPANY
8	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
9		
10	By: Jerome C. Roth	By:Andrew B. Clubok
11		Attorneys for Defendant
12	Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
13		ADMOLIA & DODAWA LLA
14	KING & SPALDING LLP	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
15		By:Matthew Heartney
16	By:Tracie Renfroe	Attorneys for Defendants
17	Attorneys for Defendants	BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODUCTS NORTH AMERICA, INC.
18	CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.	NORTH AMERICA, INC.
19		
20	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
21		
22	By: John F. Daum	By:Richard K. Welsh
23	Attorneys for Defendant	Attorneys for Defendant
24	EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	THE AES CORPORATION
25		
26 27		
28		
۷٥		
1		

1	LAW OFFICES OF MATTHEW F. PAWA, P.C.	HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP
2		
3	By: Matthew F. Pawa	By: Selvela
4		Belynda B. Reck
5	Attorneys for Plaintiffs NATIVE VILLAGE OF KIVALINA and CITY OF KIVALINA	Attorneys for Defendants DTE ENERGY COMPANY, EDISON
6	CITT OF KIVALINA	INTERNATIONAL, MIDAMERICAN ENERGY HOLDINGS COMPANY,
7		PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORP., AND THE SOUTHERN COMPANY
8	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
9	· ·	·
10	By:	By:Andrew Clubok
11		Attorneys for Defendant
12	Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
13		
14	KING & SPALDING LLP	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
15	·	By:
16	Ву:	By:Matthew Heartney
	By: Tracie Renfroe	Attorneys for Defendants BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODUCTS
17 18	Attorneys for Defendants CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.	NORTH AMERICA, INC.
19	U.S.A. INC.	
20	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
21		
22	Ву:	Ву:
, ,	John F. Daum	Richard K. Welsh
23	Attorneys for Defendant EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	Attorneys for Defendant THE AES CORPORATION
24		•
25		
26		
27		
28		
li	- 4	T

Case 4:08-cv-01138-SBA Document 124 Filed 05/28/2008 Page 11 of 21

C	ase 4:08-cv-01138-SBA Document 124	Filed 05/28/2008 Page 12 of 21
1	LAW OFFICES OF MATTHEW F. PAWA, P.C.	HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP
2	1.0.	
3	By: Matthew F. Pawa	By:
4	¥	By:Belynda B. Reck
5	Attorneys for Plaintiffs NATIVE VILLAGE OF KIVALINA and CITY OF KIVALINA	Attorneys for Defendants DTE ENERGY COMPANY, EDISON
6		INTERNATIONAL, MIDAMERICAN ENERGY HOLDINGS COMPANY,
7		PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORP., AND THE SOUTHERN COMPANY
8	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
10	By: Jerome C. Roth	By: Al B. Clubok
11		Attorneys for Defendant
12	Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
13		
14	KING & SPALDING LLP	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
15		By:Matthew Heartney
16	By: Tracie Renfroe	Matthew Heartney Attorneys for Defendants
17	Attorneys for Defendants	BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODUCTS
18	CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.	NORTH AMERICA, INC.
19		
20	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
21		
22	By: John F. Daum	By:Richard K. Welsh
23	Attorneys for Defendant	Richard K. Welsh Attorneys for Defendant
24	EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	THE AES CORPORATION
25		
26		
27		
I		
28		
	- 4	-

	<i>(</i>	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
1	LAW OFFICES OF MATTHEW F. PAWA, P.C.	HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP	, 1478) W.A.,
2			۷۰ . ۱۹۰۶ ۱ . از در ۱ . از ۱۶۰ . د
. 3	By:Matthew F. Pawa	Belynda B. Reck	
4	Attorneys for Plaintiffs	Attorneys for Defendants	n (m. 5). No. Little de
5	NATIVE VILLAGE OF KIVALINA and CITY OF KIVALINA	DTE ENERGY COMPANY, EDISON: INTERNATIONAL MIDAMERICAN	20 6 15
6		ENERGY HOLDINGS COMPANY, PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORP., THE SOUTHERN COMPANY	AND:
7		THE SOUTHERN COMPANY	
8	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP	
9	:	P	3,30
10	Ву:	By: Andrew B. Clubok	
11	Jerome C. Roth	Attorneys for Defendant CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY	14 (* 17 m) 12 m) 14 m)
12	Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	CONOCOI IIILLII 5 COMI AVI	
13		ARNOLD & PORTER LLP	
14	KING & SPALDING LLP		
15		Ву:	
16	By: ten Berline	Matthew Heartney Attorneys for Defendants	The second
17	Tracie Renfroe Attorneys for Defendants	BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODI	UCIS
18	CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.		
19		3	
20	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP	
21			
22	By: John F. Daum	By: Richard K. Welsh	- 1. j.
23	Attorneys for Defendant	Attorneys for Defendant	, A.
24	EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	THE AÉS CORPORATION	
25			
26		,	
27		· · ·	
28		,	(a)
40			

1	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
2		_
3	By:	By:Andrew Clubok
4	Π	Attorneys for Defendant
5	Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
6		
. 7	KING & SPALDING LLP	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
8		By: Mutator
9	By:Tracie Renfroe	Matthew Heartney Attorneys for Defendants
10	Attorneys for Defendants CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON	BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODUCTS NORTH AMERICA, INC.
11	U.S.A. INC.	
12	011 (17) (17)	
13	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
14	n.	
15	By: John F. Daum	By: Richard K. Welsh
16	Attorneys for Defendant EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	
17	EAAONMOBIL CORPORATION	THE AÉS CORPORATION
18	SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP	BAKER BOTTS LLP
19		
20	By:Samuel R. Miller	Ву:
21	Attorneys for Defendants	Jeffrey A. Lamken Attorneys for Defendants
22	AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER COMPANY, AMERICAN ELECTRIC	DYNEGY HOLDINGS INC., NRG ENERGY, INC., AND RELIANT ENERGY, INC.
23	POWER SERVICE CORPORATION, AND DUKE ENERGY CORPORATION	
24		
25		
26		·
27		
28		
9	. A	

С	ase 4:08-cv-01138-SBA Document 124	Filed 05/28/2008 Page 15 of 21
1	LAW OFFICES OF MATTHEW F. PAWA,	HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP
2	P.C.	
3	By: Matthew F. Pawa	By∙
4		By:Belynda B. Reck
5	Attorneys for Plaintiffs NATIVE VILLAGE OF KIVALINA and	Attorneys for Defendants DTE ENERGY COMPANY, EDISON
6	CITY OF KIVALINA	INTERNATIONAL, MIDAMERICAN ENERGY HOLDINGS COMPANY.
7		PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORP., AND THE SOUTHERN COMPANY
8	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
10		Bv:
	By: Jerome C. Roth	By: Andrew B. Clubok
11	Attorneys for Defendant	Attorneys for Defendant CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
12	SHELL OIL COMPANY	
13		ADNOLD & DODTED LLD
14	KING & SPALDING LLP	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
15		By: Matthew Heartney
16	By:Tracie Renfroe	
17	Tracie Renfroe Attorneys for Defendants	Attorneys for Defendants BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODUCTS
18	CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON	NORTH AMERICA, INC.
19	U.S.A. INC.	
20	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
21	T, C 1	
22	By: John F. Dan	By:
23	John F. Daum Attorneys for Defendant	Richard K. Welsh
	EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	Attorneys for Defendant THE AES CORPORATION
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1 2	LAW OFFICES OF MATTHEW F. PAWA, P.C.	HUNTON & WILLIAMS LLP
3	By:	D ₁₁ .
4	By: Matthew F. Pawa	Digital B. Reek
5	Attorneys for Plaintiffs NATIVE VILLAGE OF KIVALINA and	Attorneys for Defendants DTE ENERGY COMPANY, EDISON
6	CITY OF KIVALINA	INTERNATIONAL, MIDAMERICAN ENERGY HOLDINGS COMPANY,
7		PINNACLE WEST CAPITAL CORP., AND THE SOUTHERN COMPANY
		THE SOOTHERN COMPANY
8	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
9		D
10	By: Jerome C. Roth	By:Andrew Clubok
11	- The state of the	Attorneys for Defendant
12	Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
13		
14	KING & SPALDING LLP	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
15		By:
16	Bv.	By:Matthew Heartney
	By:Tracie Renfroe	Attorneys for Defendants BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODUCTS
17 18	Attorneys for Defendants CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.	NORTH AMERICA, INC.
19	C.S.R. MVC.	
20	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
21		
22	By: John F. Daum	By: Bishalk Willed
23	Attorneys for Defendant	Attorneys for Defendant
24	EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	THE AES CORPORATION
25		
26		
27		
28		
~~		
	- 4	-

	Qase 4:08-cv-01138-SBA Document 124	Filed 05/28/2008 Page 17 of 21
1	MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP	KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
2		_
3	By: Jerome C. Roth	By: Andrew Clubok
4		Attorneys for Defendant CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
5	Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
6		ADMOLD & DODGED LAN
7	KING & SPALDING LLP	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
8		By: Matthew Heartney
9	By: Tracie Renfroe	Matthew Heartney
10	Tracie Renfroe Attorneys for Defendants	Attorneys for Defendants BP AMERICA, INC., AND BP PRODUCTS NORTH AMERICA, INC.
11	CHEVRON CORPORATION and CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.	NORTH AMERICA, INC.
12		
13	O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP	GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP
14	·	
15	By:John F. Daum	By:Richard K. Welsh
16	Attorneys for Defendant EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION	Attorneys for Defendant THE AES CORPORATION
17		THE AES CORPORATION
18	SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP	BAKER BOTTS LLP
19		
20	By: Samuel R. Miller PLY	By:
21	Attorneys for Defendants	Attorneys for Defendants
22	AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER COMPANY, AMERICAN ELECTRIC	DYNEGY HOLDINGS INC., NRG ENERGY, INC., AND RELIANT ENERGY, INC.
23	POWER SERVICE CORPORATION, AND DUKE ENERGY CORPORATION	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	- 1	_

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP	
OIDED! NOS!IIVED!	BAKER BOTTS LLP
By:	By:
	Jeffrey A. Lamken Attorneys for Defendants
AMERICAN ELECTRIC POWER	DYNEGY HOLDINGS INC., NRG ENERGY, INC., AND RELIANT ENERGY, INC.
POWER SERVICE CORPORATION, AND DUKE ENERGY CORPORATION	
JONES DAY	VINSON & ELKINS LLP THELEN REID BROWN RAYSMAN
2/ 10 0 2/1 1 1	& STEINER LLP
By: Kevin P. Holewinski	
Attorneys for Defendant	By: Kevin A. Gaynor
ACEL ENERGY INC.	Attorneys for Defendant
	MIRANT CORPORATION
CROWELL & MORING LLP	
By:	
PEABODY ENERGY CORPORATION	
	By:

C	ase 4:08-cv-01138-SBA Document 124	Filed 05/28/2008 Page 20 of 21
1	SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP	BAKER BOTTS LLP
2		
3	By:Samuel R. Miller	By:
4	Attorneys for Defendants	Attorneys for Defendants
5	AMERÍCAN ELECTRIC POWER COMPANY, AMERICAN ELECTRIC	DYNEĞY HOLDINGS INC., NRG ENERGY, INC., AND RELIANT ENERGY, INC.
6	POWER SERVICE CORPORATION, AND DUKE ENERGY CORPORATION	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
7		
8	JONES DAY	VINSON & ELKINS LLP THELEN REID BROWN RAYSMAN
9	D	& STEINER LLP
10	By: Kevin P. Holewinski	V 16
11	Attorneys for Defendant XCEL ENERGY INC.	By: Kevin A. Gaynor
12		Attorneys for Defendant MIRANT CORPORATION
13		MINIMARY CORN ORATION
14	CROWELL & MORING LLP	
15		
16	By:Steven P. Rice	
17	Attorneys for Defendant	
18	PEABODY ENERGY CORPORATION	
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	-	5 -

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	RONALD L. OLSON (SBN 44597) Ronald.Olson@mto.com DANIEL P. COLLINS (SBN 139164) Daniel.Collins@mto.com MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 355 South Grand Avenue, 35th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071-1560 Telephone: (213) 683-9100 Facsimile: (213) 687-3702 JEROME C. ROTH (SBN 159483) Jerome.Roth@mto.com MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP 560 Mission Street San Francisco, CA 94105-2907 Telephone: (415) 512-4000 Facsimile: (415) 512-4077 Attorneys for Defendant SHELL OIL COMPANY	STUART A. C. DRAKE (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) sdrake@kirkland.com ANDREW B. CLUBOK (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) aclubok@kirkland.com SUSAN E. ENGEL (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) seengel@kirkland.com KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP 655 Fifteenth Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005 Telephone: (202) 879-5173 Facsimile: (202) 879-5200 ELIZABETH DEELEY (SBN 230798) edeeley@kirkland.com KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP 555 California Street San Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: (415) 439-1861 Facsimile: (415) 439-1500
		Attorneys for CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY
12		COMPANY
13		
14	TRACIE J. RENFROE (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) trenfroe@kslaw.com	MATTHEW HEARTNEY (SBN 123516) Matthew.Heartney@aporter.com
15	JONATHAN L. MARSH (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) jmarsh@kslaw.com ROBERT MEADOWS (<i>Pro hac vice</i>)	ARNOLD & PORTER LLP 777 S. Figueroa Street, 44th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90017-5844
16	rmeadows@kslaw.com KING & SPALDING LLP	Telephone: (213) 243-4150 Facsimile: (213) 243-4199
17	1100 Louisiana Street, Suite 4000 Houston, TX 77002-5213	PHILIP H. CURTIS (<i>Pro hac vice</i>)
18	Telephone: (713) 751-3200 Facsimile: (713) 751-3290	Philip.Curtis@aporter.com (Pro hac vice)
19	, ,	MICHAEL B. GERRARD (pro hac vice) Michael.Gerrard@ aporter.com
20	LISA KOBIALKA (SBN 191404) lkobialka@kslaw.com	(pro hac vice) ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
21	KING & SPALDING LLP 1000 Bridge parkway, Suite 100	399 Park Avenue New York, New York 10022
22	Redwood City, CA 94065 Telephone: (650) 590-0700	Telephone: (212) 715-1000 Facsimile: (212) 715-1399
23	Facsimile: (650) 590-1900	Attorneys for BP AMERICA, INC., AND
24	Attorneys for Defendants CHEVRON CORPORATION and	BP PRODUCTS NORTH AMERICA, INC.
25	CHEVRON U.S.A. INC.	
26		
27		
28		
ll ll		

1	JEFFREY A. LAMKEN (SBN 154217) jeffrey.lamken@bakerbotts.com	THOMAS A. RECTOR (SBN 199173) tarector@jonesday.com
2	JEREMY LEVÍN (SBN 210577) jeremy.levin@bakerbotts.com	JONES DAY 555 California Street, 26th Floor
3	BAKER BOTTS LLP The Warner	San Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: 415-626-3939
4	1299 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington D.C. 20004-2400	Facsimile: 415-875-5700
5	Telephone: (202) 639-7700	THOMAS E. FENNELL (Pro hac vice)
6	Facsimile: (202) 639-7890	tefennell@jonesday.com MICHAEL L. RICE (<i>Pro hac vice</i>))
7	Attorneys for Defendants DYNEGY HOLDINGS INC., NRG ENERGY, INC., AND RELIANT ENERGY, INC.	mlrice@jonesday.com JONES DAY
8	ENERGI, INC.	2727 N. Harwood Street Dallas, TX 75201
9		Telephone: 214-220-3939 Facsimile: 214-969-5100
10		KEVIN P. HOLEWINSKI (Pro hac vice)
11		kpholewinski@jonesday.com JONES DAY
12		41 Louisiana Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20001
13		Telephone: 202-879-3939 Facsimile: 202-626-1700
14		Attorneys for Defendant XCEL ENERGY INC.
15		
16	KATHLEEN TAYLOR SOOY (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) ksooy@crowell.com	ROBERT B. PRINGLE (SBN 051365) rbpringle@thelen.com
17	SCOTT L. WINKELMAN (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) swinkelman@crowell.com	LAURA A. GUILLEN (SBN 248874) laguillen@thelen.com
18	TRACY A. ROMAN (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) troman@crowell.com	THELEN REID BROWN RAYSMAN & STEINER LLP
19	CROWELL & MORING LLP 1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.	101 Second Street, Suite 1800
20	Washington, D.C. 20004-2595	San Francisco, CA 94105 Telephone: (415) 371-1200
21	Telephone: 202-624-2500 Facsimile: 202-628-5116	Facsimile: (415) 371-1211
	STEVEN P. RICE (SBN 94321)	KEVIN A. GAYNOR (<i>Pro hac vice</i>) kgaynor@velaw.com
22	srice@crowell.com	BENJAMIN S. LIPPARD
23	CROWELL & MORING LLP 3 Park Plaza	blippard@velaw.com VINSON & ELKINS LLP
24	Irvine, CA 92614 Telephone: 949-798-1310	1455 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
25	Facsimile: 949-263-8414	Washington, D.C. 20004-1008 Telephone: (202) 639-6500
26	Attorneys for Defendant PEABODY ENERGY CORPORATION	Facsimile: (202) 639-6604
	COMORATION	Attorneys for Defendant MIRANT CORP.
27		
28		

1	Pursuant to the Stipulation between Plaintiffs and Defendants ExxonMobil Corporation;		
2	BP America, Inc.; BP Products North America, Inc.; Chevron Corporation; Chevron USA, Inc.;		
3	ConocoPhillips Company; Shell Oil Company; The AES Corporation; American Electric Power		
4	Company, Inc.; American Electric Power Service Corporation; Duke Energy Corporation; DTE		
5	Energy Company; Edison International; MidAmerican Energy Holdings Company; Pinnacle Wes		
6	Capital Corporation; The Southern Company; Dynegy Holdings Inc., NRG Energy, Inc.; Reliant		
7	Energy, Inc.; Mirant Corporation; Peabody Energy Corporation; and Xcel Energy Inc.		
8	("Defendants") (collectively, the "Parties"), and FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS HEREBY		
9	ORDERED:		
10	The Parties shall abide by the briefing schedule and format set forth below:		
11			
12	Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1) / 12(b)(6) Briefs		
13	<u>Utility Defendants</u> ¹		
14	1. The Utility Defendants will file a single consolidated brief under Fed. R. Civ. P.		
15	12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6), not to exceed 50 pages, addressing counts 1, 2 and 4 of Plaintiffs'		
16	Complaint. Plaintiffs will file a single consolidated opposition brief, not to exceed 50 pages. The		
17	Utility Defendants will file a single consolidated reply brief, not to exceed 30 pages (i.e., no more		
18	than 60 percent of the pages allotted for the moving and opposition briefs, as contemplated by		
19	Local Rule 7-4(b)).		
20	2. American Electric Power Company, Inc., Duke Energy Corporation, and Southern		
21	Company (the Utility Defendants named in count 3 of the Complaint) will file a single		
22	consolidated brief, not to exceed 25 pages, addressing count 3 of the Complaint. Plaintiffs will		
23	file a single opposition brief, not to exceed 25 pages. AEP, Duke and Southern will file a reply		
24	brief not to exceed 15 pages.		
25	For the purposes of this Order, the term "Utility Defendants" refers to the following		
26	Defendants: The AES Corporation, American Electric Power Company, Inc., American Electric Power Service Corporation, DTE Energy Company, Duke Energy Corporation, Dynegy Holdings Inc., Edison International, MidAmerican Energy Holdings Company, Mirant Corporation, NRG Energy, Inc., Pinnacle West Capital Corporation, Reliant Energy, Inc., Southern Company, and		
27			

Oil Company Defendants²

3. The Oil Company Defendants will file a single consolidated brief under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1) addressing counts 1 through 4 of the Complaint. The Oil Company Defendants also will file a single consolidated brief under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) addressing counts 1 through 4 of the Complaint. The total number of combined pages for these two briefs shall not exceed 75 pages. Plaintiffs' opposition brief to each such motion shall not exceed the length of the motion to which it responds. The Oil Company Defendants will file a single consolidated reply brief in support of each such motion, and each such reply shall not exceed 60% of the page length of the motion that it supports.

Peabody Energy Corp.

4. Peabody will file a single brief under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6), not to exceed 50 pages. Plaintiffs will file an opposition brief not to exceed 50 pages. Peabody will file a reply brief not to exceed 30 pages.

* * *

- 5. In the alternative to the briefing format outlined in paragraphs 1 through 4 above, Plaintiffs retain the option to consolidate some or all of their briefs into one or more briefs, the total length of which shall not exceed the combined page total allocated for the Defendants' opening briefs.
- 6. The opening briefs discussed in paragraphs 1 through 5 above will be filed and served electronically on Plaintiffs on or before June 30, 2008. Plaintiffs' opposition briefs will be filed and served electronically on Defendants on or before September 18, 2008. Reply briefs will be filed and served electronically on Plaintiffs on or before November 18, 2008.

Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(2) Briefs

7. The Non-Resident Utility Defendants (*i.e.* all Utility Defendants except Edison International) will file and serve electronically on Plaintiffs a single consolidated brief under Fed.

For the purposes of this Order, the term "Oil Company Defendants" refers to the following Defendants: ExxonMobil Corporation, BP America, Inc., BP North America, Inc., Chevron Corporation, Chevron U.S.A., Inc., ConocoPhillips Company, and Shell Oil Company.

(ase 4:08-cv-01138-SBA Document 124-2 Filed 05/28/2008 Page 8 of 8			
1	R. Civ. P. 12(b)(2), not to exceed 50 pages, on or before June 30, 2008.			
2	8. The Oil Company Defendants, as defined in footnote 2 herein, will not file a brief			
3	under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(2).			
4	9. Peabody will file and serve electronically on Plaintiffs a brief under Fed. R. Civ. P.			
5	12(b)(2), not to exceed 20 pages, on or before June 30, 2008.			
6	10. The Parties will defer all further personal jurisdiction briefing and related matters,			
7	including issues related to jurisdictional discovery, until after the Court has decided Defendants'			
8	motions under Rules 12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6). In the event that further briefing on these issues is			
9	necessary, or ordered by the Court, the Parties will negotiate a mutually convenient briefing			
10	schedule at that time.			
11	11. Insofar as this Order defers opposition and reply briefing on the issue of personal			
12	jurisdiction, it does not effect a waiver of that defense by the Non-Resident Utility Defendants or			
13	Peabody.			
14	DATED: Mov. 2009			
15	DATED: May, 2008 By:			
16	The Hon. Saundra B. Armstrong United States District Judge			
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23 24				
2 4 25				
25 26				
20 27				
28				
_0				
	- 3 -			